

CONSERVATION GUIDELINES: LINCOLN-MELROSE HISTORIC DISTRICT

Property Subject to Protection
Statement of Compatibility
Architectural and Site Characteristics
Review Criteria
Alterations and Rehabilitation
New Construction and Additions
Demolition
Buildings of a Later Period
Exceptions

A. Property Subject to Protection

All buildings, sites and significant historic objects situated within the boundary of the Lincoln-Melrose Historic District shall be subject to the reviewing authority of the HCB (Historic Conservation Board) as specified in Administrative Code Sections 741-13 and 741-15.

B. Statement of Compatibility

Applications for certificates of appropriateness shall be judged by their conformance to these guidelines. All alterations and environmental changes shall be designed and executed in a manner which is compatible with and sympathetic to the architecture within the Lincoln-Melrose Historic District and shall respect the landscape characteristics of the site.

C. Architectural and Site Characteristics

The Lincoln-Melrose Historic District is located in the northern portion of the Walnut Hills neighborhood. The site is relatively flat with a slight downward slope from east to west. Two distinctive residential types, built in high style and vernacular architectural styles, are found within this district.

A row of detached single-family houses along Lincoln Avenue dominates the area. The buildings in the row maintain a uniform setback, are similar in scale and massing and are constructed of the same materials. The row has ten units along Lincoln and continues along Melrose Avenue to incorporate two structures there. Architecturally this series of structures is divided into two groups. The seven buildings on the western half are of vernacular design, with Queen Anne and Richardsonian Romanesque elements.

These houses employ a similar floor plan and a basic rectangular form with gabled roof and parapet walls. Each façade is slightly different, with various spatial forms and window treatments. These elements are representative of the architectural styles but are generally simpler than their high style counterparts. The other five units in the row are Second Empire in design. These buildings are identical in both plan and form, which features an asymmetrically-placed projecting tower entrance capped with a mansard roof. All have full-width wooden front porches and polychromatic-slate mansard roofs with classically-detailed dormer windows.

The dense, compact feeling generated by the row is contrasted by the remaining three buildings in the district. These are large free-standing dwellings set on spacious lots. All are designed in high style Queen Anne, although the house at 835 Beecher Street exhibits some Colonial Revival details.

Design elements seen on these houses include towers, spacious porches, a variety of wall surface treatments, irregularly-shaped roofs and a combination of different types of windows.

All but one of the buildings within the district are built of brick with stone trim and have slate roofs; the exception, 835 Beecher, is built of stone. The consistent use of these materials and the grouping of compatible architectural styles are strong elements in the cohesiveness of this district. The buildings in the district were all constructed within a 10-year period and represent alternative approaches to living in the City at the turn of the century. All of the structures have had only minor exterior alterations and clearly demonstrate the quality of construction and pattern of development inherent to this district.

D. Review Criteria

- 1. The architectural detailing of this district is a key element of its overall character. These features and their placement on existing buildings and on new construction are important design considerations. The details described below are characteristic of this district and should be addressed, when applicable, in alterations, rehabilitation and new designs.
 - (a) Walls
 - A variety of wall surfaces and textures are evident
 - Brick is the most common material with stone and wood details
 - Changes in wall planes as well as materials
 - (b) Roofs
 - Slate roofs are found throughout
 - Complex rooflines with a variety of shapes and multiple gables
 - Hip roofs and gable roofs are the most common
 - Flat roofs are not found in the district and their use shall be discouraged
 - Slate colored or similar shingles shall be encouraged
 - (c) Windows
 - Double-hung, casement and fixed windows are all found
 - Arched, round and rectangular openings are found throughout
 - The most common window is double-hung with single pane sash
 - Windows are found single or in groups of 2, 3, or 4, with or without transoms
 - Openings are often irregularly spaced
 - Pointed-arched openings, large picture window or sliding glass doors are not found in the district and their use shall be discouraged
 - (d) Eaves and Cornices
 - Moderate projection and overhand
 - Dentils in wood or brick
 - Simple moldings with wide fascia
 - (e) Porches
 - Generally wood with turned wood columns or masonry piers
 - Masonry foundations or masonry piers with wood infill
 - Railings use turned balusters or are of masonry
 - Spindle screens are common
 - (f) Chimneys
 - Create a strong vertical element
 - Often decorative with corbelled brickwork and paneling
 - (g) Belt Courses
 - Generally of stone with slight projection
 - Brick laid in a projecting or contrasting bond

(h) Doors

- Paneled doors with transoms and/or side lights are common
- Many doors contain glazed panels

2. Alterations and Rehabilitation

(a) Materials

Original materials should be restored and reused whenever possible. Where necessary, missing or deteriorated material should be replaced with recycled or new materials, which match the original as closely as possible with regard to:

type of material texture
size of unit style
color type of joint
shape placement
composition detailing

(b) Cleaning / Painting

Cleaning of existing material should be done by the least damaging method available. Sandblasting is not an acceptable method for cleaning. Painted brick buildings, when necessary, should be repainted rather than stripped or cleaned to reveal the natural brick color. The color of trim and decorative detailing on a building should contrast with the wall paint color; i.e., light colored buildings should have darker trim and dark colored buildings should have lighter trim. At no time should the detailing and trim be painted the same color as the walls.

(c) Windows / Doors – Openings

Original window and door openings should not be reduced or enlarged in size. Repaired or replacement windows should match the original as closely as possible in size and type of operation. Replacement windows should maintain the original pattern of window pane divisions whenever possible. The elimination or permanent concealment of window and door openings on the primary or street façade should not be permitted, and elsewhere avoided. New window and door openings on the primary or street façade should not be permitted. Removable storm windows and doors should be utilized wherever possible. Aluminum storm windows and doors should be painted to match trim.

(d) Appurtenances

All appurtenances, such as shutters, light fixtures, and signs, should be compatible with the building upon which they are to be installed. The installation of canvas canopies and awnings is permissible but should not obscure or require the removal of significant architectural features. Canopies and awnings made of plastic, wood or metal shall not be permitted.

(e) Wall Resurfacing

On structures constructed of or employing wood clapboard or shingle siding, similar wood products should be used for the repair or replacement material. The use of aluminum or vinyl siding for resurfacing should be avoided; however in cases where they are used, the exposed width of such siding should not exceed four inches. Artificial stone, brick veneer, asbestos, asphalt shingles and other similar resurfacing materials shall not be used. Architectural features such as cornices, brackets, window sills and architraves, and doorway pediment should not be removed or obscured when resurfacing material is applied. Siding should be applied horizontally and all wood siding should be painted.

(f) Roofs

The existing roofline and the architectural features that give the roof its essential character such as dormer windows, cornice, brackets, chimneys and cresting should be preserved. The addition of inappropriate features such as vents, skylights, and rooftop utilities should be

avoided, or inconspicuously placed and screened where necessary as determined by the Historic Conservation Board.

(g) <u>Utility / Systems Installation</u>

The installation of utility and mechanical systems such as water or gas meters, central air conditioning cooling units, and elaborate electrical hookups should be inconspicuously placed and screening should be provided; the installation of such systems should be avoided on the street façade. Wall or window air conditioning units on the street façade should not be permanently installed but removal window units shall be permitted on a seasonal basis.

(h) Decks

The addition of decks on the street façade shall not be permitted. Decks, installed elsewhere shall not obscure or require the removal of significant architectural features. Balusters should be vertically placed no more than 6 inches apart. Solid plank railing shall not be permitted. Railing heights should not exceed 42 inches. Screened or glass enclosed decks should be avoided.

(i) Walls and Fences

Existing retaining walls and fences should be repaired and retained wherever possible. The installation of wood or chain link fences shall not be permitted on street frontage.

(i) Site

The alteration or removal of existing walkways, steps, benches, and lighting, which contribute to the character of the district should be avoided. All new site improvements should be compatible with the architectural character of the district. Contemporary designs shall be encouraged while alterations, which seek to create an earlier appearance shall be discouraged. Tree removal should be avoided.

3. New Construction and Additions

(a) Materials

The type of materials and their color, texture, scale, and detailing should be compatible with those of the district. Masonry construction for all new construction and additions shall be encouraged. The use of wood construction shall be encouraged on porches, entries, railing, cornices, dormers, gables, an decorative wall surfaces, where appropriate.

(b) Scale

The scale of new work and its constituent parts should be compatible with the district and/or the original building and the scale of its parts.

(c) Form

The architecture of the district employs a great variety of shapes, massings, and proportions. New construction and additions should reflect this variety. Changes in wall surfaces, breaks in wall planes, porches, bay windows, dormers, towers, chimneys and similar projections shall not be discouraged.

(d) Detailing

Architectural detailing shall be compatible with the scale, proportions, rhythm, and style of the original building and/or similar detailing found in the district. The Historic Conservation board shall consider the details described in Section D of the Conservation Guidelines for this district when determining the compatibility of all new construction and additions.

(e) Height

- (1) The height of an addition should not exceed the height of the original building.
- (2) The height of new buildings should be comparable to the height of existing buildings in the district.

(f) Setback

The setback of new buildings should be comparable to the setbacks of existing buildings in the district.

(g) <u>Historic Integrity</u>

Contemporary design for alterations and additions to existing properties shall not be discouraged when such design does not destroy significant historical, architectural or cultural material, and such design is compatible with the existing structure and with the district. Whenever possible, new additions or alterations to structures shall be done in such a manner that the essential form and integrity of the structure would be unimpaired. For example, if it is necessary to fill in an original opening, the outline of that opening should be retained by recessing the in-fill material and leaving the lintel and sill in place.

4. **Demolition**

Demolition of existing buildings shall not be permitted unless one of the following conditions exist:

- (a) Demolition has been ordered by the Director of Buildings & Inspections for reasons of public health and safety;
- (b) The owner can demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Historic Conservation Board that the structure cannot be reused nor can a reasonable economic return be gained from the use of all or part of the building proposed for demolition;
- (c) The demolition request is for a garage or an inappropriate addition, and the demolition of said structure will not adversely affect the streetscape as determined by the Historic Conservation Board.

5. Buildings of a Later Period

Buildings of a later period were generally constructed after most of the rest of the district was built and are of a different architectural character than the district due to their age and sometimes also due to the different character of their scale, material, and detailing. As proposed, the Lincoln-Melrose Historic District does not contain any building of a later period.

6. Exceptions

The Historic Conservation Board may modify certain review criteria, as appropriate, in cases of economic hardship when there is no economically feasible and prudent alternative alteration or environmental change, which would conform to the guidelines. The applicant must demonstrate to the HCB that an economic hardship exists and that alternative changes, which do meet the guidelines have been explored. In addition, when the applicant demonstrates that an alteration or environmental change which would conflict with the strict application of the guidelines would permit him to achieve substantial benefits without substantial harm to the historic district, the Board may approve it upon such conditions as it may determine.